Evaluating the City Manager
Best Management Practices

FCCMA Annual Conference
Orlando, Florida
June 1, 2017

Doug Thomas
Senior Vice President
Strategic Government Resources
As any Council Member or Manager who has ever conducted or received a performance evaluation knows, the process can sometimes be uncomfortable, frustrating, and/or disappointing.

When it comes to evaluating a Manager’s performance, there are no standard models to follow:

- Often times, the process is a result of a Manager’s previous practice or recommendation.
- Others reflect a permutation of approaches that may have a long-standing history in the organization over time, but are seldom reviewed for their effectiveness.
- Best Management Practices are a product of a thoughtful and deliberative process that reflects the importance the Council places on both communication, and the Council-Manager relationship.
Common Perceptions to Performance Reviews!

In your performance evaluation, do you prefer if I use the term ‘lazy’ or ‘motivationally impaired’?
Background

Regardless what performance evaluation process a Council and Manager chooses to utilize, it is important to realize that there are many benefits that can be derived from a quality performance review process:

• Increasingly, the demands for greater public accountability and closer media scrutiny dictate that Councils be prepared to defend the compensation packages afforded Managers with a better response than “he/she is doing a great job.”

• Citizens & stakeholders are typically more interested in the results that have been attained, and having a sense that their Council and Manager are “on the same page.”
In a relationship of trust and support, Council Members and the City Manager can have an honest dialogue about what is being accomplished, where the gaps may be, and how to maintain progress. Good relationships promote candor and constructive planning.
The most common challenges Managers and Councils face with the evaluation process revolve around four general areas:

1) Failure to undertake evaluations  
2) Lack of a credible appraisal process  
3) Lack of understanding of the Council-Manager form of government  
4) Lack of communication
What is a Manager Evaluation?

1) The process of planning, reviewing, and providing feedback on the performance of the City Manager.
2) A means of demonstrating organizational accountability to citizens, employees, and local stakeholders.
3) A means of maintaining alignment between established City Council goals and achievements attained.
4) A means of determining the need for further professional development, education, or training of the Manager.
5) An element of decision regarding future compensation.
There are two fundamental aspects of performance that must be accounted for in any legitimate Manager performance evaluation process:

1) **What/Technical** - Results that should be accomplished, and the extent, efficiency and effectiveness with which specific established goals and expectations can be tracked to determine success. (i.e. Fulfillment or achievement of the Mission, Goals & Objectives of the City’s Strategic Vision Plan, operational effectiveness, fiscal and staff management, public relations, advocacy, etc.)

2) **How/Behavioral** - Leadership skills that should be demonstrated, reflecting a wide range of interpersonal and other subjective factors that are often not always easy to define, and even harder to measure. (i.e. Personal qualities such as integrity, commitment, interpersonal skills, communication and influence, financial & budgeting acumen, staff development, innovation, process efficiency, etc.)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ICMA’s 18 Core Principles for Effective Local Government Leadership &amp; Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Staff Effectiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Policy Facilitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Functional &amp; Operational Expertise &amp; Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Citizen Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Performance Measurement/Management &amp; Quality Assurance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Initiative, Risk Taking, Vision, Creativity, Innovation &amp; Continuous Improvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Technological Literacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Democratic Advocacy &amp; Public Engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Inclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Budgeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Financial Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Human Resources Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Strategic Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Advocacy &amp; Interpersonal Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Presentation Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Media Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Integrity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Personal Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What is the Role of the Council?

1) Be familiar with all Charter provisions and Council policies that define how authority is delegated to the Manager and its proper use monitored; the Manager’s role and his/her authority and accountability; constraints on the Manager’s authority which establish the practical, ethical and legal boundaries within which all staff activity and decision-making will take place and be monitored; and what the Council intends for the City to achieve.

2) Review & discuss the performance instrument to be used with the Manager to ensure it meets the needs of both parties. Schedule the agreed upon frequency for the performance review(s), providing at least an annual review of the Manager’s performance and achievements.

3) Maintain a balance of support and trust with a relationship of accountability with the Manager.

4) Based on the results of the comprehensive annual review, Council determines any need for further professional development, education, or training for the Manager, and ultimately adjusts compensation accordingly.
What is the Role of the Manager?

1) Review & discuss the performance instrument to be used with the Council to ensure it meets the needs of both parties.

2) Ensure that the Council has adopted an organizational Vision, Mission, Goals and Objectives that can be objectively tracked to determine progress/success as part of the performance review process.

3) Completion of a self-evaluation, providing elected officials the process by which he/she pursued organizational and individual goals, and the perceptions of both the Manager and stakeholders of his/her success or failure in meeting those goals during the review period.

4) Written compilation of individual & organizational accomplishments and challenges faced during the entire evaluation period to minimize the risk of Council focusing on whatever the most recent controversy, agenda item, or news story immediately preceded the Manager’s performance review.

5) A listing of recommended goals, objectives and strategies that can serve as the foundation for discussion with the Council to establish agreed-upon desired outcomes for the subsequent review period.
Recommended Approaches

• First, talk to with your Council about the level of satisfaction with your existing process, playing close attention to your Council’s wants and needs, and how you can reinforce your role and responsibilities as their Manager.

• Second, examine an array of approaches that other communities utilize, and speak with local government consultants and peers for ideas, what has worked for them, what hasn’t and most importantly, why.

• Finally, determine what are some of the specifics you could recommend and implement to improve the quality of the performance review process and enhance the degree of public accountability.
Manager Accomplishments Examples

City of Williston
North Dakota

P O Box 1306
Williston ND 58802-1306
PHONE: 701-713-3830
FAX: 701-577-8800

Manager Accomplishments Examples

DATE:  
TO: City Commission
FROM: Six Month Review

Re: Manager Accomplishments

My first six months as City Administrator have been both exciting and challenging. I have appreciated the opportunity to learn more about the various City departments while getting to know the staff. What follows is my attempt to highlight some of my efforts and achievements, while bringing awareness to some of the areas in need of attention.

City Department by the Numbers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>2017 Budget</th>
<th># Staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Airport</td>
<td>$2,200,000</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auditor</td>
<td>$1,377,000</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building Safety</td>
<td>$3,613,307</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>$446,804</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>$1,257,600</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>$51,092,314</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning &amp; Zoning</td>
<td>$556,904</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>$56,075,450</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>$181,556,804</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>$1,035,000</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

My impression after one semester of work is that things in the City of Williston are healthy and running well, but there are many more pressing priorities and needs than I have the capacity to address. My agenda continues to be reviewed every day, often with meetings from the moment I start in the morning, until into the evening. In an effort to remain productive, and not just busy, I have attempted to strike a balance between making time for meetings, and setting time aside to complete tasks and follow up on important items for the commission. To that end, most of my first few days have been spent working on XWA and City staff priorities, which is in line with what I expected. With that said, managing time and avoiding being "stuck in the weeds" has been a real challenge, but one that is currently being made easier with help from Peggy Masters and Craig Perron.

The XWA project, while challenging and complex, has been a much better track than it was in 2016. Costs are continuing to decrease and we have successfully entered the construction phase as of April. With some new members on the board, I hope to see further cost savings and time efficiencies and remain confident we can meet our goal of a 2018 fall opening.

Overall, I have found that each department is staffed with capable, caring people, and while they need support from time to time, they are doing a truly fantastic job serving the city. As we discuss and establish our goals for the future, I remain confident knowing we will be successful due to the dedicated people that contribute to our community.

In my First Year Game Plan, presented during the preliminary hiring phase in fall of 2016, I proposed reorganizing the City Administrator's office to serve three primary areas: the City Commission, City Staff, and the Public. Of the numerous initiatives undertaken for 2017-18, progress has been made on the following key items to date:

City Commission:
- Simplified commission meetings, shortened agendas
- Initiated regular update meetings with individual commissioners
- Recruited and hired interim chief financial officer
- Continued to support City/Country/State relationship building efforts

City Staff:
- Initiated regular update meetings with individual department heads
- Initiated monthly "leadership meetings" with all department heads at once
- Provided leadership on XWA construction project
- Assisted with development of succession/transitions plans for Public Works, Police, Airport

Public:
- Developed concepts for City logo/brand
- Completed revisions of City website with Economic Development
- Initiated "customer feedback" survey on a trial basis
- Continued to work with residents and groups with complaints, concerns and issues with ordinances, access to staff and other issues
-Began analysis on customer service strategies in each department

My goal is to continue to be a primary concern for Anthony, as the airport industry tends to be highly competitive in recruiting skilled operations officers. Anthony appears to have a good staff team that works together, and follows his direction well, and he needs to fill the Assistant Airport Director position by August 2017.

Goals & Recommendations:
I have recommended to Anthony that he take some time before filling the Assistant Airport Director position, which he originally intended to fill immediately. Female committed to working with Anthony a little more closely due to his relative inexperience at the leadership level. One of our near-term future goals is to work with HR to develop a future organization chart and begin planning the staffing model for XWA. Future meetings with Anthony include performance/transition discussions (40-day, 90-day, 6-month interval to come) and dedicated monthly one-on-one meetings thereafter.

Chris and Anthony seem to have a great relationship and work regularly. Although Dransette has not been involved in airport matters, Anthony may benefit from consulting with her on a periodic basis as she seems to have an effective way of engaging young professionals and has a good rapport with him.
Manager Accomplishments Examples

BALLISTON

AUDITOR / FINANCE
Leader: John Kustermans, Auditor
Commissioner: Brad Bekkedahl
Budget: $5,107,300
Staff: 27

Synopsis of work:
With the increase in the number of residents, the city has experienced growth in building permits, property values, and property taxes. The Finance Department has worked to manage the budget and ensure financial stability. The Auditor has performed audits and reviews to ensure accurate financial reporting. The Auditor Office has also worked to improve internal controls and compliance with state and federal regulations.

Goals & Recommendations:
In preparation for the 2019 budget, the Auditor Office has worked to streamline processes and improve efficiency. The Auditor Office has also worked with the Finance Department to develop a long-term financial plan and to improve financial reporting. The Auditor Office has also worked with other departments to ensure compliance with state and federal regulations.

BUILDING SAFETY & CODE ENFORCEMENT
Leader: Bill Tracy, Building Official
Commissioner: Chris Brulez
Budget: $5,461,791
Staff: 26

Synopsis of work:
The Department of Building Safety has implemented new building codes and regulations to improve building safety and ensure compliance with state and federal standards. The department has also worked to improve communication with residents and businesses to ensure that they are aware of the new regulations and how to comply with them.

Goals & Recommendations:
The department has set goals to increase public awareness of building safety regulations and to ensure that all new buildings meet the new standards. The department has also worked to improve its internal processes to ensure that all building permits are processed in a timely manner.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
Leader: Shawn Winkel, Executive Director
Commissioner: Brad Bekkedahl
Budget: $841,810
Staff: 4

Synopsis of work:
Williston Economic Development has worked to attract new businesses and to support existing businesses in the area. The department has also worked to improve the quality of life for residents and businesses by improving infrastructure and providing economic development services.

Goals & Recommendations:
The department has set goals to attract new businesses and to provide support services to existing businesses. The department has also worked to improve the quality of life for residents and businesses by improving infrastructure and providing economic development services. The department has also set goals to increase public awareness of the economic development services provided and to ensure that businesses are aware of the services available.

WWW.GOVERNMENTRESOURCE.COM
Manager Accomplishments Examples

City of Lakeland

Noteworthy Organizational Accomplishments

By Program Area

October 2013 – September 2014

Legislative Services

- Assistance to the City Commission in the development and advancement of Lakeland’s Annual Legislative Agenda. The City was involved in a number of state-wide and local legislative issues, including:
  - SB 406 which was the State’s omnibus economic development package. The bill contained language and a fund mechanism for Florida’s Spring Training teams and teams. Specifically, the bill provided for $30 million, over 30 years, for the construction or renovation of Major League Baseball spring training facilities for one or not one team. The bill contained a的技术 provision that would require the team to pay the State back in full if they leave prior to the 30-year commitment.
  - The 2014 Florida State Budget contains $24,859,440 in State Aid Funding for Public Libraries, an increase of more than $3 million. This is the final increase in Public Library funding in over 7 years.
  - SB 1600, the 2013-14 appropriations bill, contained $3.75 million in funding to assist the City of Lakeland in its efforts, along with Polk County, to combat the problems with the Skyway Tilter and Water Quality utilities and connect the private systems to the City’s public systems.
- Co-Chaired the Florida City County Managers’ Association (FCCMA) Legislative Committee. Also served on the Lakeland Chamber of Commerce Governmental Affairs Committee and the Polk League of Cities Finance, Taxation and Personnel Legislative Committee.

Environmental & Utility Services

- Completion of the $80 million Smart Grid Initiative on schedule with support from $15 million DOE grant involving the installation of roughly 120,000 smart meters, numerous public outreach efforts to train residents on how to back their energy usage in a variety of ways, new web outage management system and withheld rate hike plan. The vast majority of customers are experiencing savings under the pilot grid programs which will become part of community discussions regarding the development of a new rate design to be presented to the Utility Committee and City Commission in Fiscal Year 2014.
- Completed the 3-year phase in of the City’s Pay-As-You-Throw “EZCan” Program which commenced in 2011. The once a week, automated trash collection system has resulted in cleaner neighborhoods, improved employee safety, increased recycling and reduced cost. The program has become recognized as an industry leader by public and private waste management entities nationally and abroad, in both Canada and New Zealand, for driving best practices with the utilization of Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) technologies in the solid waste industry.
- The successful “EZCan” residential solid waste program was followed up with the implementation of a single stream recycling program in December 2012 and the subsequent roll out of the new automated “EZCan” recycling program. “EZCan” received the delivery of roughly 30,000 new recycling carts and became operational in October 2013. The new recycling program provided customers with a choice when placing their recycling cart and staff and developed agreements to the program during implementation in response to customer requests for an additional period in which to select their final recycling cart size.
- Development of a new commercial automated recycling program to compliment the implementation of the new single-stream EZCan residential curbside recycling program. The commercial program will leverage synergies with the residential recycling program and utilize state-of-the-art technology.
- Completed construction of the Solid Waste Division’s innovative new administrative facility. The building is the City’s first Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) Gold certified facility, which was completed on time and within budget.
- Completed the second phase of the solar farm project (3.0 MW) located at Lakeland Linder Regional Airport. Between Linnell and TLC, Lakeland Electric currently has 5.5 MW of PV capacity under contract with SunEdison, generating 11,006 tons of carbon offset. The SunEdison PPA was renegotiated in FY 2013, which will result in estimated annual $500,000 savings after contract built out.
- Lakeland Electric achieved a 95% satisfaction level based upon 3rd party administered customer satisfaction surveys, breaking last year’s record level rating of 99%. The utility was also recognized by the electric utility benchmark group for System Average Interruption Duration Index (SAIDI) for 77 minutes and Customer Average Interruption Index (CAI) of 53 minutes.
- Unit #3 attained an Equivalent Availability Factor of 93% (Best in Class performance for North America) and an Equivalent Forced Outage rate of 3%.
- Successful renegotiation of the successful 2-year Lakeland Electric Unit CDA with the UUA and the inaugural 3-year CDA with the UUA Utilities Unit.
- Other Lakeland Electric utility accomplishments include continuation as a low rate leader in the state; conversion in the shift to Illinois coal resulting in over $2 million in fuel cost savings; evaluation and implementation of longer life steam turbines for Unit #3; installation of a $32 million steam turbine, providing 370 MW in power; and new 50 MW combined cycle unit.
- The Water Division completed the following notable capital projects: Williams Water Treatment Plant chlorine building improvements, filter category emergency replacement, and P&SC System replacement. Other significant projects include the Highlands Booster Station emergency power project and piping, Southwest Booster Station emergency power, Vulnerability Assessment Update, and related utility work in conjunction with the FDOT US 92/Walding (from Brooksville to Edgewood).
- Waste Water Division notable projects include chlorine containment at both Glenade and Northside Waste Treatment Plant; design phase of the Skyline Wastewater Collection system and further implementation of combined water metering and access control system and combination with local RCO for construction of lift station and force main at the Counties facility to eliminate surface water drainage and associated regulations.
- Steel seaweed frequency increased from one occurrence in the previous year to a steady occurrence. Curb moves swept in FY 2013 (31,400) exceeds goal expectations by 7%. In December 2013, an FY 2014 Program Budget was recognized by the Government Finance Officers Association (GFOA) through their ‘Distinguished Budget Preparation Award’ in recognition of its sound planning, content and overall presentation. The award is bestowed on only a select percentage of public organizations.

WWW.GOVERNMENTRESOURCE.COM

15
Manager Accomplishments Examples

- The City adopted the Northwest Lakeland Sector (7) Plan in September 2012 and two other Plans prior to that (Southwest Lakeland and Downtown). Staff has initiated work on the next Sector Plan for East Lakeland Sector (6), which generally covers the Crystal Lake and Combee Road areas.

- The Planning Division managed several amendments over three separate Plan amendment cycles. These included a request to change land use from commercial to a public gathering place. The request was approved by the City Council.

- The City completed several projects that improved the infrastructure in the area, including the construction of a new road and the expansion of the existing one.

Cultural & Community Services

- New furniture was purchased from the local furniture store to enhance the comfort and functionality of the main building.

- The Cultural & Community Services department was awarded a grant for a community arts program to support local artists and organizations.

Community Safety

- Successful economic recovery for Police Officers, Sergeants and Lieutenants represented by the Police Benevolent Association (PBA).

- Successful successor Collective Bargaining Agreement with Fire Fighters/Driver Engineeers and Lieutenants represented by the International Association of Fire Fighters (IAFF).

Transportation Services

- Completed roughly $15 million of previously awarded grant supported capital improvements at Lakeland Regional Airport including the new $30 million terminal, which significantly reduced waiting times for passengers.

- The LPA's K9 Unit became National Champions at the USPCA National Trial, with Officer Ted Salley and his K9 partner Bruno winning Top Dog.

- The LPA implemented a significant rebalancing which better aligns functions and the distribution of personnel. The following are the new bureaus that were created: Administrative Support, Neighborhood Services Bureau, Special Services Bureau and Investigative Services Bureau.

- Implemented COP-DOTS within the Community Services Unit, which is designed to allow citizens to mark their personal belongings that can be read with a scanner in the event it is stolen and recovered.

- Hearing completion of the implementation of the Tobin Records Management System. This was the second and final component of the changeover from the former intergraph system.

- Completed the expansion project of adding an additional building at the LPO. Training Center comprised of three classrooms capable of training approximately 50 individuals at one time.

- The LPO was Re-Accredited by both the Commission on Law Enforcement Accreditation (CALEA) and the Commission for Florida Law Enforcement Accreditation (CFA).

- Expansion of the City’s Red Light Camera Program to include an additional top 10 intersections to address safety concerns as recommended by the LPO and the Traffic Services Division.

- Opening of temporary Dial A Ride Fire Station at LLRA last summer with resulting ISO rating change from Class 10 to a Class 3 in southwest Lakeland. Award of design contract and subsequent bidding and award of permanent station construction with groundbreaking ceremony scheduled for November 18th with projected completion and operational status at the start of FY 2015.

Occupancy rate at LLRA is at over 92% at its current facilities, involving a strategy of attracting and retaining key tenants and entering into longer term lease agreements.

- LLRA’s Annual Part 150 inspection was completed by the FAA with no discrepancies or violations noted.

- LLRA was one of the first airports to convert to the FAA’s NOTAM Manager System allowing the issuance of real-time NOTAM’s.

- Considerable advocacy efforts with the FAA to retain FAA Air Traffic Controllers for the Sum-n-Fun event for $250,000, which was funded locally through joint participation from the City, Sun-n-Fun, Polk County Sports Marketing and Tourism and other funding partners. Successfully worked in tandem with other Airports to maintain FAA Controller funding in contract negotiations for 2013.

- Staff applied for grants through the Port Transportation Planning Organization for trails and pathway projects totaling over $4,601,000, with most being accepted and ranked for funding by the TPO for the next updated FDOT Work Program.

- Participated in multiple meetings related to the FDOT Rail Relocation Study and exploration of alternatives, including short-term projects in downtown Lakeland to facilitate bike/pedestrian movement.

- Additional work with the FDOT and CSX to prepare New York Ave Rail Grade Crossing Application, downtown future rail safety enhancements and HS Quiet Zone Application. The City remains on track to secure approval for the Federal Rail Authority for formal establishment of a Quiet Zone In downtown Lakeland.

- Installation of new Pay-by-Space machines in Muny Park and Mitchell’s Coffee House parking lots.

- Designed and coordinated with FDOT for new Fire Station #7 emergency traffic signal on Draper Road and with the Polk County School Board for a new traffic signal accessing the Steeple Hill Middle School.

- Implemented various Lake Hollingsworth Drive Safety Enhancements improvements including bicycle signals, green bike lanes and bike boxes, bike bollards, shoulder widening, driveway improvements, audible vibratory devices and new bike lane signs and markings. Performed before and after traffic studies to gauge the effectiveness of these improvements and coordinated with the Federal Highway Administration in compliance with the pilot project.

- Completion of sidewalk improvements along Main Street, Ingraham Ave, Lincoln Ave, McDonald Street, New York Ave, Fifth Street, Canlon Street and the Buckingham Trail.
LEADERSHIP AND MANAGEMENT

PLANNING - Ability to anticipate and analyze problems; maps effective solutions.
(A) Unacceptable (B) Poor (C) Satisfactory (D) Good (E) Excellent

Comment:

ORGANIZING - Ability to manage work efficiently and apply resources.
(A) Unacceptable (B) Poor (C) Satisfactory (D) Good (E) Excellent

Comment:

Referring to the Council’s HiPPO Strategic Visioning Goals and the City Manager’s Priorities of January 5, 2011, one sees that the projected timelines for accomplishing this are not being met. Understandably, issues arise. It is still the responsibility of the City Manager to see that these quarterly projected timeframes are adhered to and if not, to provide an explanation as to why the goals are not being met. It is a matter of applying more financial resources, staffing, and/or time, the Council should be updated and given the opportunity to make changes accordingly. Not having these critical conversations or having base levels to benchmark and/or understanding future implications, undermines the dissection of particular areas of discussion:

1. Traffic impact Fees delinquency (2nd Quarter) - now is a missed opportunity with one of the largest projects already approved. 2nd Organizational Structure (2nd Quarter), 3rd Implement/Financial Software (2nd Quarter), 4th Contract Negotiation (1st Quarter), and 5th Cell Service/Broadband Improvements (2nd Quarter).

For the Traffic Impact Fees, it would have been worth it to contract with a consultant to do the work. Poullino Public Works provided all the materials including the name the contracted consultant. If so, we are missing out on Traffic Impact Fees that would have been collected as development has now picked up. It is an open question if that cost the City money.

Some things seem to have taken longer than they should have. Specifically, the RFP for new software:

1. CM should provide options for current things that have to be dropped from the work plan if C.I.S is adding more.

2. CC acknowledges that choices must be made instead of just adding new items to the plan.

3. CC does not feel like they have adequate long range strategies

SUPERVISION - Builds and motivates a team, provides direction, monitors and adjusts performance as necessary.
(A) Unacceptable (B) Poor (C) Satisfactory (D) Good (E) Excellent

Comment:

Hosting the Employee Appreciation BBQ and actually inviting City Council Members was a good team-building event.

With recent employee departures, it is my understanding that the City Manager provided direction and employees that did not follow the direction and did not meet expectations chose to seek employment elsewhere.

I have to assume this because staff appears to be

I can’t answer this

Slow to adjust performance

DELEGATION - Effectively assigns work to others and builds skills.
(A) Unacceptable (B) Poor (C) Satisfactory (D) Good (E) Excellent

Comment:

$5MM

A number of cases he has transferred reports and paperwork that came out under his signature were prepared and released by his staff and “missed the mark”

FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT - Accuracy and consistency reports and projects the financial condition; management practices and policies are designed to maintain or achieve a sound, long-range financial condition.

(A) Unacceptable (B) Poor (C) Satisfactory (D) Good (E) Excellent

Comment:

Accurate and concise reports and projects financial condition:

- The Comparable Cities Report was missing the important fact that our City has a very limited amount of services, whereas many of the other cities have nearly triple the services, employees, and taxing capacity.

- Financial information is presented in a mathematical worksheet format. Arguably, one has to work through information to find what are the actual amounts. Preventing ranges that shows the decreases and increases and finally present either the under budget or over budget.

- The City does a good job of doing budget adjustments when increases are necessary. It would be great to provide similar budget adjustments for opportunities to reprogram funds that are known will not be spent otherwise. Simply carrying this funding over to the next year creates missed opportunities.

Management practices and policies are designed to maintain or achieve a sound, long-range financial condition.
### NEW OBJECTIVES

- List any new priorities you would like the City Council to establish for the City Manager.

List of priorities that should be given more attention:

1. Implementation of organizational structure modifications – i.e. recognition that was scheduled for by 2nd quarter.
2. Traffic Impact Fees.
3. Financial and Project Management Software.
4. More data and data into a Cloud-based system.
5. Budget: Follow the Budget Calendar: Hold Council Retreat to Establish Policies, Make Budget Adjustments, and Create a Citizen’s Guide to the Budget

### QUALITY OF MUNICIPAL SERVICES

Please rank each of the following direct services on progress that has been made since the City Manager came on board.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street Maintenance</th>
<th>Drastically Improved</th>
<th>No-Change</th>
<th>Drastically Declined</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Police Services</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks/N/A</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water/Sewer</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning/Zoning</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Code Administration</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal Control</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction/Eng.</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Street</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solid Waste/N/A</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Health</td>
<td>Drastically Improved</td>
<td>No-Change</td>
<td>Drastically Declined</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CM has too much on his plate, so he’s a hard one. It is the Council that must stop piling new, special interest work on top of the challenging list of original objectives. My “new” objective for him would be to push forward on a number of critical issues before him – in particular, a strategic plan and ensuring that the organization is adhering to the principles and goals of our current Plan.

### AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT

- Hire City Attorney.
- Present comprehensive analysis SWM utility 2013 carry-forward.
- Assess and update fee schedule.
- Traffic Impact Fees 2013 carry-forward.
- Develop and launch comprehensive Communications Plan 2013 carry-forward.
- Citizens’ Guide to the Budget (one of the important elements)
- Public Safety Strategic Plan.
- Address Perimeter recommendations with frequent updates about progress.
- Implement M3000 and Tableau recommendations.
- Develop and present level of Service analysis with revised recommendations for 2015-17 Biennial Budget.

For the Police Department and implement the recommendations of the Dallas and Perdixson reports.

- Since I have been on the Council, we have been told that the work plan informs the budget, the budget is always approved prior to the council and City Manager creating a work plan. I would like to see the Council create a 2014 work plan prior to, or at least in step with, the 2014 budget process. I believe CM agrees with this and if he does I think he should be more vocal about it.

- The need to build trust was priority when CM was hired so it’s not new, but I would like to see CM be more proactive in asking people what he can do to move it along. I get the sense from CM and others, that just telling people they need to trust the City is enough.

- Planning Department:
  - People are still being told 10 weeks for a SFAR building permit
  - Process needs to be easier to understand for the average person
  - I’m really bothered by the fact that someone can propose a camp plan amendment that staff does not recommend, but 3 years staff will recommend an identical camp plan amendment made by a different person when there has been no change in policies used to support or deny the request.
  - Inconsistencies – consider reducing parking requirements and at the same time, add as potential work plan item(s), the need for a parking structure because there’s already not enough parking.
  - The City needs to (be) very clear about what rules and procedures. It’s all internal. Perimeter commissions and committees are required to operate under, and (2) develop a process to ensure that committees and commissions are made aware of and understand those rules and procedures.

Benchmark cost and service level of city’s services and develop goal and plan to improve.

### Approval

1. City Manager is slow to other, non-responsive to my emails.
   - In just reviewing emails from Klyde until mid-July, there are over 30 unanswered emails from the City Manager. At times, I have to end up calling or walking over to City Hall to get an answer.
2. On occasion, City Manager and Staff presentations are not included in the City Council agenda packet materials.

This means the City Council and the Community is not in the position of having to consider the material on-the-fly and does not allow for City Council and the community to be ready to issue an informed conversation, precise thoughtful questions, and/or provide meaningful comments. Unfortunately at times is also feels as if it is a strategy to limit crucial conversation and not having the material prior to the meeting ends up creating some doubt.

BackRequirement: ensure packet with Important documents, continuous.

This occurred just last week with the Perdixson Report, an in-depth review of the Police Department. So the Council received it just prior to city council meeting and the community did not have. If material cannot be provided in time, the item should be rescheduled for a future
Rating Example

- I understand that CM wants to leave policy discussions up to the council but there have been some discussions during our discussions concerning fact. It appears to have been stated that CM should correct. For example, when a council member says that there has been no analysis done by staff, I think it would be appropriate for CM to correct that statement.
- I have concerns about how receptive staff has been to changes and how CM handles that.
- See above re 2014 Work Plan

Provide council with preliminary information earlier with appropriate caveats and risks

OTHER STRENGTHS

Like other strengths which you feel are notable.

 hurts outside auditor from the new station. I have noticed the City Manager’s posting on HUD in favor of performance and transparency.

Through and Bad Hike Process. As noted above, his hits have been excellent.


Focus. One of the City Manager’s strengths is his presentation. Going into his office and seeing three whiteboards organized by departments with the latest topics/triggers is impressive. For me the image gives him great power and focus and it is pleasing to see him completing.

Accomplishment. Although I am disappointed by certain priorities not yet addressed, I do see that much is being accomplished through the City Manager’s leadership. My impression is due to meeting the end of the council term. I was assistive to assist with these last 2 and half years to get things implemented. It will take 6 years total for City’s website to be complete, and nearly 8 months to get the City to accept credit card payments.

- Permitting process is being improved.
- Public Works department is being restructured.
- Police Department now has new leadership. It has recommendations from Auditor and the Ferarrell Report to implement and focus is being placed on creating and implementing a strategic plan.
- The City has completed or nearly completed large policy projects: Shoreline Master Plan, H20, and Winter Utility Improvements.

- There is greater attention being placed on public works maintenance and landscaping.
- The City grounds and properties look well maintained. Even many of the downtown traffic medians are being tended. The City trees are being taken care of with watering bags placed around each trunk. The dozen or so street lamps that work are working are almost all working.

- Resolving the Roadway/Beach issues that both the City Manager and the Interim Public Works Director interest were done in a timely and professional manner.

Ultimately, it is my hope that the City Manager has great success on bringing I stand and emphasizes the opportunity to work with the city council and community to create positive change. In addition to getting the important foundation work of the City done, the City Manager has an opportunity to work with the city council and community to create legacy projects such as waterfront park, Police Fire Station, ferry terminal redesign, and the Sound to Olympic Trail. This is the place that the City Manager could enjoy inspiring and creating long-term employment working. I hope, right up to his retirement. Good things to be done are never ending!

CM has enormous potential if she can be allowed to fully perform. I find him to be honest, direct, good natured, intelligent, and fair. Most of the roadblocks in his way are petty Council demands, which are at times inconsistent, unclear and/or forced into tight timelines. However, CM has the power to set boundaries. I understand that in light of the recent history of this organization, it may seem unlikely to appear in any way constrains to Council demands. However, CM deserves (and I think needs) the ability to actually perform his job. A professional must be allowed to fully use his professional knowledge and experience. A City Manager must have full control of his organization. If the Council sees one hand behind CM’s back, then loses the ability to legitimize evaluate his performance.

Ultimately, CM’s decision to tolerate micromanaging, overstating or other failures to abide by the priorities of the Council Manager form of government will impact not only his experience during his tenure (and his ability to be successful) but will establish such poor practices for his successor. The cost of these poor practices is an act of profound inefficiency of the organization, poor morale among staff and continuing loss of confidence by the community. At worst, the organization may fail.

For me, CM’s strengths are those that prompted his hiring to lead municipal administration experience and knowledge, steady temperament and test, energy and enthusiasm for City of Ballard’s (and) These have been well demonstrated and continue to be important for the continued growth and health of our city.

- Very approachable and easy to talk to
- Patient
- Takes criticism and suggestions well, committed
- Doesn’t get involved in council drama
- Has found many “housekeeping” items that were missing from our code

WWW.GOVERNMENTRESOURCE.COM
Rating Example

[Image of a rating form for City Manager Performance Review]

City Manager Performance Review – November 2011

I. FISCAL MANAGEMENT [446]

What I like: Doug has my full trust and confidence. He has a handle on the budget and great grasp of the financial and fiscal condition of the City's operations. Doug [job] is very tough task. Much more than last year. His [budget workshop] worked, it was excellent, but it worked. The end result was that we understood the appropriate process/priorities, and what had been done to achieve the budget projections. The City staff took an on the new budget. The budget workshop efforts were very good. I again Doug for what he has accomplished. Doug has done an exceptional job of managing the processes of the current times. He has positioned the City to operate efficiently with a knowledgeable team. [Doug] does a good job on managing financial resources. Revenue are at 18.5%, which is more than the 7.5% requested by council. I am glad that [Doug] took the initiative on the budget workshops. [Doug] did [another] job in a very difficult environment. Preparation, presentation and engagement during the budget process was the best I have experienced.

What I would like to see more of:
- [I would like to see] (in a percentage of) all of the reserves amount in ALL departments each year. There is an opportunity to better engage the business and community leaders in understanding the fundamentals of the city's financial posture, how it impacts services delivery, quality of life and the choices the community will need to make.

What I would like to see done differently:
- I do not have much faith in [specific fiscal practice]. I will hold the City Manager responsible.

II. SUPERVISON & LEADERSHIP [594]

What I like: When I need all of the accomplishments [Doug] has done last year, I know why we were all enthralled. It was amazing what [Doug] accomplished — any project for the City and all of its cost. [Doug's] sustained effort, year-round, requires incredible skills. [Doug] is doing decisions — new police chief, report director. I have seen a very positive change in [specific area].

What I would like to see more of:
- Labor negotiations may produce equitable results for both union and non-union employees — the efforts must be more closely communicated to the City Commission and all of the stakeholders.

City Manager Performance Review – November 2011
V. COMMUNITY RELATIONS

What I like:

Good to see more community involvement. Much better. [Doug] is much more visible.
There is only one way that [Doug] can do, and he does it all well. [Doug] is more visible and accessible. In my opinion, he has improved in the area. He is genuinely concerned about what is good for the City. [Doug] tries, but he is not naturally comfortable in community social settings.
Great job serving the Public on the FLCCM board. Great job in serving on the Legislative Committee. Great job on being appointed to the Legislative Committee. Great job serving on the Legislative Committee. Great job serving on the Legislative Committee. Great job serving on the Legislative Committee. Great job serving on the Legislative Committee.

What I would like to see more of:

Overall, good performance in this area. [Doug] works diligently to nurture and develop great relationships throughout the community, with his peers and various stakeholder groups.

What I would like to see done differently:

No comments in this area.
Rating Example
Post Review Work Plan Example

City Manager Performance Evaluation Work Plan

Organizing – Ability to arrange work efficiently and apply resources. Rating 2.27

Feedback received on this item resulted in some Council Members citing performance as "Acceptable" or "Poor." Because progress isn't being made truly quickly, but other rating performance in the same range because I tend to add too many new items, which allows progress on existing items.

To address the concern, City Manager will:

- Work with City Council to focus resources on work that is Quadrant I tasks (long-term development, strategic) and less time on Quadrant II/III tasks.
- Provide an assessment of options for current issues that may need to be dropped from the work plan if the City Council does not join resources.
- Help the Council establish long-term strategies which will provide a context for specific priorities within the work plan and help ensure that the most important things are receiving priority attention and resources.

Delegation – Effectively assigns work to others and builds skills. Rating 3.51

To address the concern, City Manager will:

- Continue developing and providing opportunities for staff to develop personally and professionally.
- Review duties of City Council that initiatives are part of the learning process.
- Clearly communicate expectations to staff when assigning.

Timing – Makes decisions when sufficient information is available. Rating 2.54

To address the concern, City Manager will:

- Present options to Council with a quick assessment of both options, and the Council can decide from aggressive they want to be and how much risk they are willing to undertake or any given item.
- Provide agenda items to the Council on a timely basis for the next Wednesday meeting with all presentation materials included.
- Provide Council with information for the next task at the close.

Financial Management – Accurately and concisely reports and presents the condition management practices and policies are designed to maintain (or achieve) a sound, long-term financial condition – plans and capital strategies, plans for long-term replacement and maintenance of equipment and infrastructure.

To address the concern, City Manager will:

- Bring recommended cost savings to City Council to allow City Manager to amend budget within limits.
- Bring budget adjustments forward when excess savings or challenges are identified.
- Maintain strong financial balances and financial condition.
- Develop recommendations for equipment replacement program.
- Develop reports/tables to communicate financial condition more clearly.

Communication with Governing Body – Accurately communicates the direction given by the governing body and keeps all informed with concise and written communication.

To address the concern, City Manager will:

- Be more proactive in communicating with members of the City Council.
- Establish regular meetings with members of the City Council to discuss issues of concern and interests.
- Notify Council of key staff matters that may be of interest to the community.
- Look for opportunities to share good news on positive things that are happening in the community.
- Provide the Mayor and Council with "rapid response" talking points on major issues such as the landfill when a newspaper story comes up that will likely create other questions on discussion.

Leadership – Guides effectively. Rating 2.24

To address the concern, City Manager will:

- Create a more strategic focus for the long term, and begin to actively bring forward ideas on how we get to where we want to go for the long term.
- Assess where we compare with other cities, and build on ways to get the most out of the resources we have available.
- Continue implementation of high performance model.
Pitfalls to Avoid

1) Council Members represent a diverse group of voices that may not be unified in their expectations of the Manager.
2) Relationships are too close, supportive, and friendly, there can be a reluctance to bring up areas of performance that need improvement and a tendency to avoid conflict.
3) If elections have taken place and the Council conducting the evaluation is not the same Council that completed the previous Manager performance review, it is important that the newly elected officials immediately be introduced to the established performance goals, measures, and evaluation process, ideally during their orientation period.
4) Compensation adjustments do not reflect the results of the annual review.
5) City Council Members often have little to no experience in performance reviews.
Pitfalls to Avoid

• A good evaluation process is designed to increase communication between Council Members and the Manager regarding his/her performance in accomplishing assigned duties and responsibilities, and the establishment of specific work-related goals and objectives. Therefore it is recommended that all members of the Council participate in the process, both by individually completing the rating instrument and by discussing their ratings collectively to develop a consensus regarding performance expectations.
• It may be useful, particularly if the Council Members are inexperienced in performance evaluation processes, to use a consultant to help the Council prepare for and conduct the Manager’s evaluation.
• Once the consultant has collected the information, the consultant typically meets with the Manager to provide an overview of the results, and then facilitates a session with the Council and Manager to review the conclusions, build consensus on the ratings, and assist in developing goals for the next review period.
Pitfalls to Avoid

• When an evaluation is completed by a group of people, it is important that it reflect the consensus opinion of all members. This consensus can be accomplished by having each member individually rate the Manager, followed by a group discussion to arrive at a final consensus rating for each measure.

• During the review session, the consultant (or one Member) can facilitate a group discussion on the divergent comments to help provide clarity and agreed upon direction for the Manager to pursue in the next review period. It is important that each Member’s ratings, whether positive or negative, be backed up with specific comments and examples, so that the whole group understands the reasoning behind them as part of this discussion.

• If individual comments (those that do not necessarily represent the sentiments of the Council as a whole) are to be included in the final document that will be discussed with the Manager, the Council should decide in advance whether those comments will be anonymous or attributed to the individuals making them.
Compensation Issues

Often, factors other than the performance evaluation form the basis of compensation decisions. These nonperformance considerations include:

1) The economic climate of the community and region
2) The general status of compensation decisions in the private sector of the community
3) The compensation decisions for other employees of the local government
4) A general review of the competitive position of the local government in the local government's market area
5) A comparative salary review. In summary, the performance evaluation of a Manager can provide input into compensation decisions by the Council. Ideally, but not typically, the communication value of an evaluation is best served by a periodic evaluation (i.e. quarterly or semi-annual) not directly tied to compensation.
Summary - Keys to a Successful Review

Step 1: Review & Discuss Evaluation Process
- Review & discuss the performance instrument to be used, utilizing instruments that have proven to be successful elsewhere that include both Technical & Behavioral aspects

Step 2: Summary of Accomplishments & Goals for Next Review
- Manager to prepare list of accomplishments for entire review period, Self-Review & suggested Goals for subsequent review

Step 3: Honest Completion of Review Instrument
- Council to familiarize with Charter provisions and Policies re: Manager authority, review Manager’s Summary, and be honest with grades and remarks, providing details about positives as well as areas requiring attention

Step 4: Group Review of Results & Setting of Goals
- Facilitated review session to discuss the results of the Review to ensure consensus and clear direction on desired actions and performance goals going forward
Good Luck!
Questions & Comments

For More Information:

Doug Thomas
Senior Vice President
Strategic Government Resources
(863) 860-9314
DouglasThomas@GovernmentResource.com